Municipal Best Practices for Attracting and Retaining Immigrant Artists and Cultural Workers

Karin Kronstal

and

Jill L Grant

School of Planning
Dalhousie University
Halifax, Nova Scotia

METROPOLIS

Centre Métropolis Atlantique
Atlantic Metropolis Centre

May 2011

In *Rise of the Creative Class*, Richard Florida introduced the concept of human creativity as "the key factor in our economy and our society" (Florida, 2002, p. 6). At the heart of Florida's theory of economic growth lies what he terms the "Super-Creative Core": researchers, university professors, designers, architects and professional artists of all types (Florida, 2002, p. 68). The popularity of Florida's approach to development – to attract creative people to lead innovation and growth -- has led countless municipalities in Canada and the United States to adopt strategies aimed at attracting the new urban creatives.

In his early work Florida presents creative workers as a relatively unified economic class whose members share similar preferences in how they choose where to live. Other research on creative class migration, however, reveals that members of different creative professions choose where to live based on occupation-specific concerns, as well as on personal preferences (Bramwell, Nelles and Wolfe, 2008; Donegan et al., 2008; Storper and Scott, 2009). Data on working artists in particular have indicated significant differences between artistic specializations (Bennett 2010; Markusen and Schrock, 2006) but suggested some patterns common to artists as a migrant group. Thus municipalities interested in attracting artists can use these findings to create policies specific to the opportunities present in their communities.

This paper briefly explores best practices in attracting and retaining immigrant artists. The first section considers current literature on the push/pull factors that affect the migration of practicing artists and identifies recent trends. The second section looks at strategies used in various regions of Europe, North America and New Zealand interested in attracting artists. The third section examines the Canadian context and shows that municipal plans and policies can enhance and

3

support cultural industries. Given that much of Canada's population growth comes from immigration, this section pays special attention to the linkages between immigration and cultural plans.

Recent Literature on Artist Location Choices

In defining talented and creative worker categories census reports and government agencies often group arts and culture workers with sports and recreation professionals; however, "the location and work behaviour of sports players and artists are strikingly different" (Markusen and Schrock, 2006, p. 1663). Indeed, of the numerous published studies on creative class preferences, few focus on professional artists as a distinct group. Notable works on artist migration include a recent study of emigrants from Western Australia (Bennett, 2010) and Markusen and Schrock's work on artists in the United States (2006). Drake's 2003 study of the impact of place on creative workers in England provided further supporting data on the factors affecting artists' migration.

Dawn Bennett (2010) looked at the factors influencing decisions by members of the core creative class (music, film and visual artists) of Perth, Western Australia, to leave their home region for Eastern Australia or overseas destinations. The study sought to discover why these members of Perth's creative class chose to migrate, what influenced their choice of destination and the degree to which they remain connected to their home province.

Bennett found that, like most migrants, artists move among regions and countries to improve their chances of occupational success. However, artists differ from other professionals in that they usually move on the basis of *perceived opportunity* and *place reputation* rather than for a specific

4

employment position. Established creative industries, strong public support for the arts and/or a sufficiently large population to consume cultural goods strongly attract artists. Also, artists differ from other creative professionals in their willingness to move away from established social and familial networks to practice their craft. Moving away from networks without the security of a job offer, however, often leads to "an unstable migration involving financial risk" (Bennett, 2010, p. 125).

Markusen and Schrock (2006) adopted an occupation-based approach to understanding the economic contribution and location choice of different artistic sectors. These authors used quantitative data to assess whether specific US metropolitan regions specialized in attracting particular sub-groups of artists and identified reasons for these trends. They started from the premise that artists differ significantly from other members of the creative class in their tastes and interests but can be targeted by municipal policies through occupation-specific strategies. The authors suggested cities already attracting artists investigate to what niche market the city appeals because it is easier to draw more of the same types of artists than to attempt to create new industries.

Drake (2003) contrasted the location choices of craft metalworkers and digital media workers in a study looking at the relationship between place and individualized creativity. Drawing on interviews with workers in the creative sector in three cities in England, Drake sought to understand the degree to which *locality* served as a source of aesthetic inspiration for particular types of cultural production. He found significant differences between the two sub-sectors, concluding that place-based attributes can provide cities with "non-substitutable" advantages,

5

allowing them to become a magnet for creative workers (Drake, 2003, p. 523). He identified four

ways in which specific place attributes mattered: locality as a resource of raw visual materials and

stimuli; locally based intensive social and cultural networks; locality as a brand based on

reputation and tradition; and locality-specific communities of creative workers.

Employment of Artists

With few exceptions, professional artists tend to be low-income earners, many holding multiple

jobs in addition to practicing their craft (Hill Strategies, 2009). Markusen and Schrock (2006)

found that artists working in a creative hub (an area with a high percentage of artists) reported

higher wage earnings than those in peripheral areas. However, it was not clear whether this was

due to higher income from the arts or greater opportunity for secondary employment. In fact, the

instability and unpredictability of artistic employment may cause many to burn out and leave the

arts. In a study of undergraduate dance majors in the United States, Montgomery and Robinson

(2003) found that few people continue working only as dancers for more than ten years; those

employed in dance relied heavily on non-dance jobs due to the sporadic nature of dance

employment. Moreover, very few of those considered to be employed in dance were performers;

most worked in dance facility administration, choreography and instruction.

Markusen and Schrock (2006) noted artists are more likely than the average worker to be self

employed; this matters in terms of attracting artists because self-employment allows for flexibility

in location choice. Writers have the highest reported self-employment at 68 percent, while at 24

percent, performing artists have the lowest. (The overall rate in the general population is 8

percent.) Bennett (2010) concluded that having an adaptable practice (such as being a pianist who can teach, perform and record) provided artists with greater flexibility in location, making them more likely to stay in peripheral regions. Artists who work exclusively in real time, such as orchestral musicians, do not have this opportunity.

Bennett (2010) suggested that due to the risk involved, most *planned* artist migration takes place before artists begin a professional career (either before or after post-secondary training). Established artists, she argued, were generally pushed to move. Such *reactive* migration resulted from lack of creative infrastructure or opportunities for career development in the home region. Opportunity does not necessarily mean full-time employment; for example, even in established creative hubs like Berlin, most artists worked at multiple jobs (Dellbrugge and de Molle, 2005). However, if a city cannot offer the desired level of social and physical infrastructure (e.g., performance venues), artists will leave for places they believe will better meet their needs.

Attracting Artists to Smaller Cities

Overall, large centres have a distinct advantage for attracting artists: Markusen and Schrock (2006) suggested several reasons why. First, major cities have the population and tourism potential to provide markets for cultural products and performances. Higher wage-earning groups (typically other knowledge workers) supportive of an artist-friendly urban agenda tend to live in large cities. Also, artists may cluster in cities with complementary industries such as advertising and media to take advantage of the additional work opportunities. Such industries often cluster in world class centres such as New York. Finally, artists seeking to collaborate with creative workers in other

disciplines may find that larger centres offer greater opportunity for such creative synergy.

At the same time, however, small- and medium-sized cities have some advantages over big cities: they often have lower housing costs and accessibility to natural landscapes. This may be enough to attract artists, particularly those who don't need access to performance venues. "Prior research has found that performing artists are more apt to live closer to metropolitan cores than are visual artists and writers, with musicians in the middle range" (Markusen and Schrock, 2006, p.1664). Furthermore, isolation may appeal to some artists: Gibson, Luckman and Willoughby-Smith (2010) drew on a government study of the small, remote town of Darwin in tropical Northern Australia, where interviews with and surveys of nearly 100 cultural workers found geographical distance a key source of creative inspiration.

Markusen and Schrock (2006) outlined three areas of action that municipalities of all sizes can take to increase their artistic appeal. First, invest in cultural infrastructure, such as artist live/work spaces and performance venues. Cities can support the creation of artist-run centres, institutions that often bring in artists from other areas for residencies and learning exchanges. Second, municipalities can connect the artistic population with complementary industries to encourage crossovers between sectors to increase opportunities for employment. Finally, cities interested in expanding their creative sectors may wish to re-evaluate how public money is spent on the arts: major one-off events generate less cultural / economic development than smaller grants to local organizations.

Bennett suggested small cities use social media to promote *artist connectivity*, one of the most

8

important elements for attracting and retaining artists: "Smaller centres require a greater entrepreneurial approach to creating and managing performance or exhibition opportunities" (Bennett, 2010, p. 124). For cities with artist-training centres, establishing young artists' connectivity with the region *during and immediately after* post-secondary education may prove effective in retaining the population over the long term.

International Best Practices

The case examples below highlight municipal approaches to drawing and keeping artists, including place branding, cultural planning, and progressive social policy. Stakeholders in the non-profit and private sectors play an important role in helping cities attract and retain artists. This section looks at examples of non-municipal bodies that support new and emerging artists through offering mentorship programs, providing access to space and creating opportunity with industry. While often relying on private funding, these programs indicate what kind of partnerships municipalities can seek when looking to collaborate with other actors or to fund external programs.

Municipal Strategies

a. <u>Branding Places:</u> Berlin, Germany

Many major world cities have adopted place-marketing strategies (Jensen, 2007), but few have invested as heavily as Berlin in re-inventing their urban image. In 2008, the Berlin Senate launched the "*be Berlin*" capital city advertising campaign. The Senate committed 11 million Euro to the

place-branding effort after market research indicated the city suffered from a poor international reputation. The campaign aimed to strengthen the city's positive image and promote it on a national and international level as a great place to live and do business.

The first year of the campaign focused on encouraging local residents to take pride in their city, using multimedia and participatory strategies to solicit Berliners' personal stories. Highlights from the 2008 campaign included sending 1,350,000 letters to Berlin households asking for their input; publishing a campaign book and creating a campaign film; developing public billboards, video advertising, and a line of manufactured items for the brand with a temporary storefront; installing a subway station advertisement called "the longest love letter to Berlin," featuring 2,000 messages submitted by residents; and organizing a three-week city-wide scavenger hunt for billboard riddles.

In 2009, the campaign broadened its horizons to focus on an international audience with the revised slogan *Berlin, the place to be*. This campaign highlighted Berlin as the place to be for five things: business, science, art, city life and change. Berlin Days, a traveling exhibit, went on tour to New York, Brussels, and Shanghai before visiting Istanbul and Copenhagen in the summer of 2010. The tour promoted the city to potential tourists and migrants alike, noting, "Some stay for the night, others stay forever."

b. Putting Culture First: Cultural Planning in Austin

With a population of 757,688, Austin is the fourth largest city in Texas and the self-proclaimed "Live Music Capital of the World." Beginning in 2007, the municipality undertook a 16-month

10

public consultation that led to the creation of the 2009 Cultural Master Plan, *CreateAustin*. Described as a both a community cultural planning process and a public/private collaboration, the Plan promoted arts, culture and creativity as "essential keys to Austin's distinct and unique identity" (*CreateAustin* Summary, 2009, p. 11).

CreateAustin emphasized the contribution artists make to Austin's social and economic prosperity. The Plan made several recommendations aimed at raising the profile of artists and the arts, including consolidating all cultural programming in a new Department of Arts and Culture. The report also recommended building new partnerships with private industry, universities and community-based organizations to better leverage existing resources. The municipality promised to invest in new cultural spaces while improving access to existing facilities. At the same time, a public awareness campaign encouraged local residents to appreciate the importance of the arts to the Austin brand in an effort to garner support for the new investments.

c. Creating Progressive Social Policy: Santa Fe, New Mexico

The oldest capital city in the United States, Santa Fe became the first UNESCO-designated creative city in the country in 2005. To bring attention to its unique creative industries, the municipality focused on expanding the multicultural artistic community. Santa Fe's population of 72,000 makes it the fourth largest city in the state. The area has long been known for Aboriginal and folk crafts and music, but migration over the last two decades allowed Santa Fe to build on traditional artistic sectors to become a globally recognized creative city.

Weekly and yearly art markets provide regular opportunities for artists to sell and promote their work. Two take place year-round, with three annual international festivals to draw tourists to the area (the International Folk Art Market in July, the Spanish Market in July, and the Indian Market in August). Then in 2008, the municipality released the Cultural Voices Initiative, a comprehensive study of the challenges and opportunities for diverse artists in the city.

In 2007, Santa Fe mayor David Cross introduced a living wage ordinance requiring businesses with more than 25 employees to pay their staff $9.50 an hour (the amount deemed necessary to stay above the poverty line). Living wage policies particularly benefit artists and new immigrants, two groups often working in such low-income sectors as sales and services. While local debates raged as to whether Santa Fe's economy suffered as a result of the ordinance, David Cross's re-election in May 2010 suggested high levels of voter satisfaction.

Stakeholder Programs

a. Developing Artist Mentorship Programs: New York City and Hamilton, Ontario

The New York State Council on the Arts established the New York Foundation for the Arts (NYFA) in 1971 as an independent organization whose mission is to "empower artists at critical stages in their creative lives." The NYFA started an Immigrant Artist Project to better serve artists of diverse backgrounds who share the experience of immigration. The project objective is to "connect immigrant artists with the necessary resources to foster their creative careers, gain

support and exposure for their work, and integrate them into the art world of New York and beyond while upholding their distinct identities" (New York Foundation for the Arts, 2010, online).

The Immigration Artist Project focuses on four areas: providing information through a newsletter and online outreach; offering a mentoring program; providing cultural community workshops; and publishing a resources directory highlighting services for immigrants. The mentoring program paired a working American artist with an emerging immigrant artist from the same or similar disciplines for a period of six months. As a result, this popular program proved highly successful in helping newly arrived artists gain a foothold in the New York arts scene.

Mentorship programs for newcomer artists are not limited to large cities like New York. The Immigrant Art and Culture Association of Hamilton, Ontario, offered an example of such a program in a medium-sized city. A non-profit group established in 2000, the Immigrant Art and Culture Association, catered specifically to the needs of immigrant artists but worked to support all immigrants and low-income artists. In addition to an artist mentorship program, the Association offered workshops, job search support and free art classes for young clients.

b. Providing Space for Art: Berlin, Germany, and Providence, Rhode Island

Access to affordable work and performance space poses a major challenge to many professional artists. The Cultural Project of the Professional Association of Berlin Artists describes itself as a self-help project for and by Berlin artists. An artist-funded organization with over 2000 members,

the organization worked "in deliberate opposition to individual sponsorship through stipends and prizes" by providing to all professional artists access to its studios. The group provided free and/or subsidized access to the infrastructure required for artistic production. While use of the print and sculpture workshop involved a nominal fee, the group provided free workshops and administrative help. A limited number of subsidized studio spaces were available. The group refused public funding (claiming that doing so would compromise its basic principles of freedom of expression and artist self-management).

Located in Providence, Rhode Island, AS220 is a non-profit community arts space. The organization described itself as committed to providing "an unjuried and uncensored forum for the arts" (AS220, 2010, online). The centre offered a spectrum of programs, some catering to professional artists (e.g., residencies) while others were open to the general community. AS220 acted as an incubator for emerging artists, a meeting space for community groups, and as an arts promoter in the broader community. The organization's mission statement emphasized the accessibility of the space, offering the assurance that "If you live in the state of Rhode Island, you will get an opportunity to exhibit or perform at AS220" (AS220, 2010, online).

c. Partnering with Industry: New Zealand and Nashville

The success of the *Lord of the Rings* trilogy provided New Zealand unprecedented exposure as a location for film shooting and production. Film New Zealand, an independent, industry-led organization, seized on the opportunity by launching an international campaign to market the nation's film industry. The international focus of Film New Zealand complemented the mandate of

the New Zealand Film Commission, the government agency responsible for supporting New

Zealand-based filmmakers. (The Film Commission offered some funding for co-productions with

non-New Zealand filmmakers, but at least 20% of the production content had to come from New

Zealand artists.) Recent activities of Film New Zealand included a "You're Welcome" exhibit at

the 25th annual Film Locations Trade Fair in Los Angeles, California.[1]

Nashville has long been known as Music City, and in 2009, the Nashville Area Chamber of

Commerce collaborated with the Office of the Mayor to create the Nashville Music Council. The

new Council included over 60 musicians and industry executives, including high-profile musicians

such as Jack White of *White Stripes* and Emmylou Harris. The Council's mandate focused on five

economic development goals: growing the Music City brand, increasing jobs, offering public

education music programs, growing the live venue scene and attracting creative talent to

Nashville.[2]

Immigrant Artists: **Immigration and Cultural Planning in Canadian Cities**

---

[1] The government of New Zealand has adopted more aggressive immigration policies in recent years in an attempt to stabilize a decreasing population and stimulate economic growth, using a points-based system similar to that of Canada. Immigration New Zealand also offers a work to residence talent visa similar to that of Australia, to persons of "exceptional talent in a declared field of art, culture or sport." Eligible applicants must be sponsored by a New Zealand organization of national repute, be less than 55 years of age and meet health standard requirements. Successful applicants are granted a working visa for up to 30 months, after which they may apply for permanent residency.
[2] Tennessee is home to another aspiring creative city. Located 133 miles from Nashville, Chattanooga (population 155,000) is the fourth largest city in the state. Since 2006, the non-profit group Choose Chattanooga has offered a program called ArtsMove, which provides $2,500 to individual artists willing to relocate to within 3.5 miles of downtown Chattanooga for at least one year. Essentially a downtown development scheme intended to revitalize the core by bringing artists from the surrounding region to central Chattanooga, ArtsMove is now in its fourth of five funding rounds.

The case examples highlight strategies that cities seeking to maximize their social and economic potential by attracting artists have taken in recent years. Some places, such as Santa Fe, paid attention to the multicultural dimension of the population. Other cities, like Austin, called themselves "a creative city" without critically examining how this collective identity does or does not include artists from diverse ethnic communities.

According to recent Statistics Canada projections, by 2031, Canada's population growth will come from immigration. Given such trends, Canadian cities will see a major overlap between the goals of attracting artists and attracting immigrants more generally. With concerns about population decline in regions outside the largest Canadian centres, many smaller cities have developed official immigration strategies. Meanwhile, the immigration hubs of the nation -- Toronto, Montreal and Vancouver -- struggle to provide services and support to a rapidly growing and increasingly diverse population.

Canadian cities operate under a different immigration system than their American and European counterparts, but many use the identified best practices seen in other countries to inform their economic and cultural strategies. The Canadian cities discussed below have adopted varying approaches to integrating cultural and immigration objectives; comparison sheds light on different places seeking to support diverse creative communities.

Ottawa, Ontario

The City of Ottawa is in the process of creating an integrated immigration strategy called the

Immigration Ottawa Initiative. The 2007 document *Faces of Ottawa* provides a snapshot of immigrants to the Ottawa region. Ottawa benefits from significant secondary migration from Quebec and receives the second largest number of refugees per year in all of Canada. Ottawa's immigrant population is highly educated (82 percent have a university degrees), with over half being between the ages of 22 and 44 years. The most commonly cited reason for moving to Ottawa is to join family or friends. Ottawa's *20/20 Talent Plan* stresses the importance of creating an open and accessible labour market that will attract and retain workers from around the globe but does not mention the cultural sector or cultural workers as an area of specific interest.

The City of Ottawa prepared its 2003 *Arts and Heritage Plan* within the broader context of the Ottawa 20/20 initiative, a two-year planning process intended to manage growth and change over the next 20 years. This initiative aims to balance social, economic and environmental objectives for long-term sustainability. The Arts Plan lays out a 20-year plan with five strategic objectives: broaden public access to the local arts, keep Ottawa's artists in the region, build creative capacity, revitalize public places and natural spaces through the arts, and realize the economic potential of the local cultural sector. The Arts Plan commits the city to strengthening and supporting multi-disciplinary community arts programs and developing a multi-sectoral support system aimed at building creative capacity within Ottawa's distinct and diverse communities.

New programs proposed by the Arts Plan include a Seed Funding Program for "Artistic Activity in Distinct and Diverse Communities" and "Arts Programs for Specific Communities", such as ethnic minorities and youth. The Plan explicitly states the intent of these programs is neither to

"ghettoize nor give special long-term status to specific work [by diverse communities].

Instead, this temporary support is intended to provide opportunity to specific artistic

traditions and artists whose work has not been easily folded into mainstream funding

programs. This opportunity to catch up will allow for development as well as smooth

transition into general, overall support programs" (Ottawa Arts and Heritage Plan, 2003, p.

40).

Montreal, Quebec

As the city receiving the largest number of Francophone immigrants in Canada, Montreal blends

cultural and immigration policies in a different way than other Canadian cities do. Despite the

city's efforts to create an inclusive environment for newcomers and its reputation for high quality

of life, a significant percentage of immigrants leave the city after becoming permanent residents of

Canada.

The City of Montreal has a Cultural Services department responsible for arts and cultural planning.

The department's strategic objectives are outlined in the implementation plan for the 2005-2015

Cultural Development Policy, *Montreal Cultural Metropolis*. Following the publication of the

report, City of Montreal Cultural Services began providing funds for what it termed "cultural

mediation" services. The report identified problems regarding the accessibility of cultural activities

and services to the general population, especially marginalized communities. Through these

programs, Cultural Services aims to "create genuine encounters between artists, their works and

the public" (City of Montreal Cultural Services Website, 2010).

Though not the provincial capital city, Montreal's unique position in Canada as a cultural capital and the largest Francophone centre generates benefits from several provincially and federally sponsored initiatives. One notable example is Vivacité Montreal, a grant program that offers grants to young immigrant and visible minority professional artists living in Montreal. This three-year program receives funding from the Canada Council for the Arts, the Montreal Arts Council and the provincial Conseil des arts et des lettres. Now in its final year, Vivacité Montreal offers emerging immigrant and minority artists a non-renewable grant of up to $10,000 each to develop their work.

Edmonton, Alberta

In 2005, the City of Edmonton created the Office of Diversity and Inclusion, with the mandate to ensure that an increasingly diverse urban population has equal and fair access to municipal services and opportunities. Five years ago, the City commissioned a study that made several recommendations about how to attract and retain more immigrants to Edmonton. The City has followed many of these recommendations but not yet developed a municipal immigration plan.

To raise Edmonton's international profile as a creative city, the document *The Art of Living: A Plan for Securing the Future of Arts and Heritage in the City of Edmonton* (2008-2018) recommends creating an Edmonton International Mentorship Prize, a grant that would be used to bring an artist of international repute to Edmonton for a period of one to six months. Invited artists would teach and mentor local artists, drawing attention to Edmonton's artistic potential. Also, in 2008, the City of Edmonton established the Cultural Diversity in the Arts Award. This program

provides up to 12 awards of $7,500 each to encourage and support Edmonton artists from ethnically diverse cultural backgrounds and to engage those artists in the broader Edmonton community.

Vancouver, British Columbia

The 2008-2018 *Culture Plan* for Vancouver positions the city as "on the cutting edge of art, culture, education, entertainment, and the support of the creative industries" (2008, p. 5). The Plan supports diverse cultural and ethnic groups by providing community grants to non-profit organizations. The fine arts community receives significant support through programs such as the Cultural Infrastructure, the Mayor's Arts Awards and the Artist Live/Work Studio award: the latter is intended to increase the accessibility of productive space for artists in one of the most expensive urban areas of Canada.

The City of Vancouver does not have an official immigration strategy but it has been attending to immigration policy and settlement programs since the 1990s. Overall, its role in immigration issues has been to facilitate integrating newcomers into the local community, enhance access to civic services and programs, and ensure broad engagement and participation of diverse groups, including newcomers, in different civic activities. In 2007, the City formed the Mayor's Task Force on Immigration that made recommendations to improve accessibility of services. Suggested initiatives included establishing the Equal Employment Opportunity Program to provide training opportunities to staff on diversity-related issues and for supporting local social and cultural development initiatives through the provision of civic grants to local non-governmental

20

organizations, many of which deliver services to newcomers.

Calgary, Alberta

Calgary Arts Development (CAD) is an arms-length organization responsible for distributing the bulk of the city's annual arts budget. The organization's 2009 report, *Lead with Culture*, highlights the growing role that the arts sector plays in the local economy. Municipal support for the arts substantially increased between 2004 and 2009, with new funding for grants, non-profit arts organizations, cultural infrastructure and festivals. Creating artistic space remains a focus of the organization, with up to $165 million dedicated to cultural infrastructure over the next decade. Other initiatives include creating a downtown cultural district, launching a new website (www.calgaryculture.com) and declaring September "Culture Month". Among the 160 organizations receiving support are the Brazilian Community of Alberta, the Calgary Chinese Orchestra, the Calgary Multicultural Choir, the Hispanic Arts Society and ethnic dance groups. (The City of Calgary is creating an immigration strategy but had not released details by summer 2010 when this research was conducted.)

Toronto, Ontario

One of the most diverse urban regions in the world, the Greater Toronto Area attracts the greatest proportion of Canadian immigrants. With over half the GTA population born outside of Canada, Toronto seems poised to continue its strong record of immigrant attraction and retention. However, increasing numbers of immigrant inflows create many challenges for the city in terms of service

21

delivery and social equity (Toronto, 2001). A 2007 study of the link between economic prosperity and social inclusion, *Prosperity and Opportunity in Toronto: Getting it Right,* observed that the economic underperformance of the region's immigrant population suggests many experience difficulty accessing Toronto's labour market.

> "The difficulty for recent immigrant residents to [find work] commensurate to their skill set damages Toronto's ability to continue to attract highly skilled immigrants and the city's ability to compete in the international marketplace" (Toronto, 2007, p. 3).

In 2004, the Ontario Ministries of Economic Development and Trade funded the Strategies for Creative Cities Project. In partnership with the University of Toronto and creative industry leaders, the project produced the 2006 report *Imagine a Toronto…Strategies for a Creative City.* The report recognizes Toronto's multicultural community as a vital source of creative talent that represents "a critically important economic asset" (2006, p. 13). The most recent City of Toronto economic development strategy, the 2008 *Agenda for Prosperity*, adopted many of the report's recommendations. The Agenda highlights diversity and social cohesion as part of the Toronto Advantage. Creativity, Culture and Entertainment are keys to the strategy: Toronto's creative industries generate 90% of Ontario's cultural goods, with over $9 billion in GDP per year. The report discusses how Toronto can "leverage culture, events and tourism to enhance international presence." A supporting document for the Agenda for Prosperity, the *Creative City Planning Framework* (2008)*,* provides detail about how Toronto plans to expand its creative industries and attract new investment.

22

Halifax, Nova Scotia

Halifax Regional Municipality's 2005 economic strategy, *Strategies for Success*, drew heavily on Richard Florida's (2002) theory of economic development. The Strategy recommended collaborating with partners to develop a "Creative Community Strategy" that "integrates cultural, immigration, capital district, university and global strategies" (2005, p. 21). The section "Capitalizing on our Reputation" emphasized the importance of place branding in attracting creative workers and innovative companies. The Strategy recommended forming a Quality of Place Council that would "review existing brand equity in HRM and develop a multi-partner approach" (2005, p. 28). The Greater Halifax Partnership has moved ahead with several of these initiatives.

In 2005, Halifax Regional Municipality adopted an *Immigration Action Plan* as part of the Community Development mandate. Rather than discussing how to attract newcomers, the Plan focused on how HRM can welcome and serve immigrants already in Halifax. The agency responsible for economic development in HRM, the Greater Halifax Partnership (GHP), operates under its own *Halifax Region Immigration Plan*. As a public-private partnership, the GHP treats immigration as a means to meet existing and anticipated labour market needs. The focus of this approach to attracting immigrants to Halifax has been driven by the needs of employers for qualified workers to fill the types of positions anticipated to be in demand (largely sales, services, and health care).

In 2006, HRM adopted the region's first *Cultural Plan,* which referred to the *HRM Immigration*

23

Action Plan as a supporting plan. It outlined several policies connecting the objectives of the cultural and immigration plans. For example, Policy 1.9 recommended integrating the development of the proposed Cultural Advisory Committee with that of other proposed committees such as those proposed under the *Immigration Action Plan*. Goal 16, Arts Development, aimed to enable professional and emerging artists in all media to successfully live, exhibit and perform in HRM. This goal included Policy 4.7, under which "HRM will work with partners to help emerging artists incubate and develop their artistic and creative talent," followed by the recommendation to create an arts investment strategy that would include a new arts diversity grant. HRM continues to work towards implementing some of these proposals.

Final notes

This paper provides a brief overview of current strategies used by municipalities and stakeholder agencies to draw and support working artists (as identified in July 2010). Understanding what attracts artists to a place -- and, more critically, what keeps them there -- presents a challenge. Artists have distinct needs and interests that set them apart from other knowledge workers. Therefore, recognizing how artists differ in their location choices helps policy makers understand which strategies present the greatest possibility of successfully increasing their city's "artistic dividend" (Markusen and Schrock, 2006).

As the developed world shifts from primarily resource-based to knowledge-based economies, cities everywhere proclaim the importance of creative work. Yet while the validation of cultural workers as socially and economically valuable certainly benefits artists in some respects, many

24

cultural workers continue to operate on the economic margins of society.[3] Most earn below average incomes and rely on multiple jobs to survive. Artists working outside their country of origin may face additional barriers, such as inability to access professional networks or to negotiate language barriers. Artists contribute a great deal to the places they live but also have such unique infrastructure needs as productive space or low-cost housing. Short-term strategies may prove successful in attracting artists; however, creating a city that is both culturally rich and socially just so that artists want to stay over the long-term requires appropriate planning and investment.

---

[3] For more on artists as the new 'precariat' class, see Ross, 2008.

References

AS220. (2010) AS220 Art Space. Available online at http://www.as220.org/about/about-as220.html

Austin, City of. *CreateAustin: Cultural Master Plan Summary* (2009). Austin, Texas. Available online at http://www.ci.austin.tx.us/culturalplan/downloads /createaustin_executive_summary.pdf

Some references ending in pdf are followed by a period; some are not; for consistency, I removed all periods, but that may not be consistent with the proper style.

Baeker, Greg and Murray, Glen. *Creative City Planning Framework: A Supporting Document to the Agenda for Prosperity* (2008). Toronto, Ontario. Available online at http://www.toronto.ca/culture/pdf/creative-city-planning-framework-feb08.pdf

Bennett, Dawn (2010). 'Creative migration: a Western Australian case study of creative artists,' *Australian Geographer*, 41(1), 117-128.

Bramwell, A., Nelles, J., and Wolfe, D. (2008). 'Knowledge, innovation and institutions: global and local dimensions of the ICT cluster in Waterloo, Canada,' *Regional Studies* 42(1), 101-116.

Calgary Arts Development. *Lead with Culture: 2009 Report to the Community* (2008). Calgary, Alberta. Available online at http://www.calgaryartsdevelopment.com /files/LeadWithCulture.pdf

Dellbrugge, Christiane and de Molle, Ralf (2005). *Artist migration Berlin*, Heidelberger Kunstverein, Berlin. Available online at http://www.workworkwork.de/pdfs/kvh.pdf

Donegan, M., Drucker, J. Goldstein, H., Lowe, N. and Malizia, E. (2008). 'Which indicators explain metropolitan economic performance best? Traditional or creative class,' *Journal of the American Planning Association* 74(2), 180-195.

Drake, Graham (2003). 'This place gives me space: Place and creativity in the creative industries,' *Geoforum* 34, 511-524.

Edmonton, City of. *The Art of Living: A Plan for Securing the Future of Arts and Heritage in the City of Edmonton 2008-2018* (2008). Edmonton, Alberta. Available online at http://www.edmontonarts.ca/static_media/pdfs/ files/artofliving/cultural_plan.pdf

Florida, Richard. (2002) *The Rise of the Creative Class*. New York, Basic Books.

Gibson, C., Luckman, S. and Willoughby-Smith, J. (2010). 'Creativity without borders? Rethinking remoteness and proximity,' *Australian Geographer*, 41(1), 25-38.

Greater Halifax Partnership. *Halifax Region Immigration Plan: Business Case and Strategic Action Plan* (2005). Halifax, Nova Scotia. Available online at http://www.greaterhalifax.com/ siteghp2/media/Parent/HRIS_ActionPlan.pdf

Halifax Regional Municipality. *Strategies for Success: Halifax Regional Municipality's Economic*

Development Strategy 2005-2010 (2005). Halifax, Nova Scotia. Available online at http://www.greaterhalifax.com/ siteghp2/media/Parent/Economic _Strategy.pdf

Halifax Regional Municipality. *HRM Immigration Action Plan* (2005). Halifax, Nova Scotia. Available online at http://www.halifax.ca/Council/agendasc/ documents/ActionPlanSept05_WebRes.pdf

Halifax Regional Municipality. *HRM Cultural Plan* (2006). Available online at http://www.halifax.ca/culturalplan/documents/CulturalPlan112007.pdf

Hill Strategies Research Inc. 'A Statistical Profile of Artists in Canada: Based on the 2006 Census.' *Statistical Insight on the Arts*, 7, no. 4, 2009. Available online at http://www.hillstrategies.com/docs/Artists_Canada2006.pdf

Jensen, Ole B. (2007). 'Culture stories: Understanding cultural urban branding', *Planning Theory*, 6, 211-236.

Markusen, Ann and Schrock, Greg (2006). 'The artistic dividend: Urban artistic specialisation and economic development implications,' *Urban Studies*, 43(10), 1661-1686.

Montgomery, Sarah and Robinson, Michael (2003). 'What becomes of undergraduate dance majors?,' *Journal of Cultural Economics* 27, 57–71.

Montreal, City of. *Implementation of Montreal, Cultural Metropolis: Cultural Development Policy of Ville de Montreal 2005-2015* (2007). Montreal, Quebec. Available online at http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/pls/portal/docs/pageculture_fr/media/documents/bilanMmcfinalL_19juin_en.pdf

Montreal, City of. (2010) *Montreal, Cultural Metropolis.* Available online at http://ville.montreal.qc.ca/portal/page?_pageid=4517,7008922&_dad=portal&_schema=PORTAL

Ottawa, City of. *Faces of Ottawa: A Snapshot of Immigrant Labour Market Integration* (2007). Ottawa, Ontario. Available online at http://www.ottawa.ca/city_services/ statistics/immigration/faces_of_immigration_en.pdf

Ottawa, City of. *Ottawa 20/20 Arts and Heritage Plan* (2003). Ottawa, Ontario. Available online at http://www.ottawa.ca/city_services/planningzoning/2020/arts/pdf/arts_en.pdf.

Ottawa City of. *Ottawa 20/20 Talent Plan: A Supporting Plan of the Ottawa Economic Strategy* (2003). Ottawa, Ontario. Available online at http://www.ottawa.ca/city_services/planningzoning/2020/tal/pdf/tp.pdf

Ross, Andrew (2008). 'The new geography of work: Power to the precarious?', *Theory, Culture & Society*, 25(7–8), 31-49.

Snyder, Christine (2008). 'Cultural Voices in the City Different: Survey Summary Report', *Cultural Voices Initiative.* City of Santa Fe Arts Commission. Santa Fe, Texas. (New Mexico?) Available online at http://www.santafenm.gov/DocumentView.aspx? DID=2209

Statistics Canada**.** "Study: Projection of the Diversity of the Canadian Population." March 9, 2009.

Available online http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/100309/dq100309a-eng.htm.

Storper, M. and Scott, A.J. (2009). 'Rethinking human capital, creativity and urban growth,'
Journal of Economic Geography 9, 147-167.

Strategies for Creative Cities Project. *Imagine a Toronto…Strategies for a Creative City* (2006).
Toronto, Ontario. Available online at
http://www.utoronto.ca/progris/web_files/creativecities/ccpdfdoc/CC%20Strategy%20Report%20S
ingle%20pp.pdf

Toronto, City of. *Agenda for Prosperity* (2008). Toronto, Ontario. Available online at
http://www.toronto.ca/prosperity/pdf/agenda-prosperity-report-full.pdf

Toronto, City of. *Prosperity and Opportunity in Toronto: Getting it Right* (2007). Toronto, Ontario.
Available online at http://www.toronto.ca/prosperity/pdf/economic-competitiveness-social-
inclusion.pdf

Toronto, City of. *A Social Development Strategy for the City of Toronto; Summary* (2001).
Toronto, Ontario. Available online at http://www.toronto.ca/sds/pdf/sds_finalpolicy.pdf

Vancouver, City of. *Culture Plan for Vancouver 2008-2018* (2008). Vancouver, British Columbia.
Available online at http://vancouver.ca/creativecity/pdf/ CulturePlan2008_%202018.pdf

Other Internet Resources

Arts Council of Montreal: http://www.artsmontreal.org

The City of Berlin's Marketing Campaign *be Berlin*: http://www.be.berlin.de

Chattanooga ArtsMove: http://www.artsmove.org

Creative Santa Fe: http://www.creativesantafe.org

Nashville Area Chamber of Commerce: http://www.nashvillechamber.com

New York Foundation for the Arts Immigrant Artist Project: http://www.nyfa.org

New Zealand Film Commission: http://www.nzfilm.co.nz/

Imagine Toronto http://www.web.net/~imagineatoronto/home.htm